

CONTENTS

- Preface, xix
Acknowledgments, xxv
Introduction to the Student, xxxi

CHAPTER 1. THE LAWYER AS WRITER

- A. Learning the Language of the Law, 3
Twain, *Life on the Mississippi*, 10; Dickens, *American Notes*, 13; Parkman, *La Salle and the Discovery of the Great West*, 15; Lévi-Strauss, *Tristes Tropiques*, 17; Mailer, *Of a Fire on the Moon*, 19; Twain, *Huckleberry Finn*, 21; Labov, *The Logic of Nonstandard English*, 27
Writing Assignment 1: A Variety of Languages, 34
Writing Assignment 1, Alternative A: What Do Different Speakers Want to Know, 36
Questions: *Defining a Language System*, 37; Questions: *Drawing Inferences from Speech*, 39; *Harvard Law Review, With the Editors*, 41
Writing Assignment 1, Alternative B: What Has It Meant for You to Learn the Legal Language System, 43
Question: *Who Will You Become?* 47; James, *The Art of Fiction*, 48
- B. Success for the Lawyer and Writer: Establishing the Right Relationship with His Language, 49
1. Defining the Relationship Between Self and Language: *Troilus and Cressida*, 51
 2. Traditional Ways of Controlling a Language, 56
 - a. Metaphor, 57
Blake, *The Sick Rose*, 58; Conrad, *The Mirror of the Sea*, 60
 - b. Irony, 64
Thoreau, *Walden*, 65
 - c. Ambiguity, 67
Frost, *The Road Not Taken*, 69; Melville, *Billy Budd*, 70

- d. The Power of the Language Maker, 76
Writing Assignment 2: Controlling a Language System, 77
Writing Assignment 2 (Alternative): Good Writing, 78

CHAPTER 2. THE LIMITS AND RESOURCES OF LEGAL LANGUAGE: AN INTRODUCTION TO YOUR LITERARY CIRCUMSTANCES

Introduction, 81

- A. Your Language in a Universe of Languages — A Comparative Anthology on Death, 83
 - 1. What the Law Leaves Out: The Law Among Other Possibilities for Expression, 84
 - a. The Georgetown Hospital Case: A Paradigm of Legal Speech? 84
 Application of the President and Directors of Georgetown College, Inc., 84
 - b. One Way the Lawyer Speaks About Death: The Will, 89
 Casner, Will of Richard Harry Black III, 89; Will of Edmund Burke, 94; Thomas, A Refusal to Mourn the Death, by Fire, of a Child in London, 97; Ransom, Janet Waking, 98; Dickinson, The Last Night That She Lived, 99
 - c. Versions and Conversions of Experience: Imagining What the Law Would Do, 100
 The Story of Burnt Njal, 101; Malory, Le Morte Darthur, 104; Clarendon, The History of the Rebellion and Civil Wars in England, 107; Aeschylus, Agamemnon, 109; Adams, The Education of Henry Adams, 110; Macaulay, The History of England from the Accession of James II, 111
 - d. A Primary Distinction in Talk About Death: Humanity and Inhumanity in Speech, 114
 Cromwell, Letter to Colonel Walton, 114; Boyertown Burial Casket Company, Shareholders Report, 117; Manual Outlines “Perfect Sniper,” 118; Hoess, Commandant of Auschwitz, 119; People v. Sherwood, 122
 - e. Justifying a Language by Its Special Purposes, 126
 - 2. Defining Viciousness in Language and Imagination: The Rhetoric of the Death Penalty, 127
 Royal Commn. on Capital Punishment, Report, 128; Colorado Revised Statutes, 130; Camus, Reflections on the Guillotine, 131; Furman v. Georgia, 137; Donnelly, Goldstein, and Schwartz, Criminal Law, 142; Dickens, A Tale of Two Cities, 149; Orwell, Shooting an Elephant, 151

3. Complications: False Pretenses and Rhetorical Resources, 153
 - Gibbon, *The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, 153; Hume, *The Life of David Hume, Esq.*, 157; Smith, *Letter to William Strahan*, 160; Thucydides, *History of the Peloponnesian War*, 165; Froude, *History of England from the Fall of Wolsey to the Death of Elizabeth*, 166; Shakespeare, *Romeo and Juliet*, 166
4. Professional Attitudes: Uses and Effects of Professional Rhetoric, 167
 - Joyce, *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, 168; Proust, *Remembrance of Things Past*, 170; Norton, *The Treatment of a Dying Patient*, 174
 - Writing Assignment 3: Defining by Comparison the Literature of the Law*, 181
 - Writing Assignment 3, Alternative A: The Law Controls the Speaker*, 182
 - Writing Assignment 3, Alternative B: Drafting a Complaint*, 182
 - Writing Assignment 3, Alternative C: A Judicial Opinion in the Georgetown Hospital Case*, 186
 - Writing Assignment 3, Alternative D: The Lawyer's Conversations on Death*, 186
- B. The Voices of the Lawyer, or: What Can You Say in the Language of the Law? 187
 - Problem: *The Sabbatarian and the Military Law*, 188; *Selective Service Act of 1967*, 189
 - Writing Assignment 4: The Lawyer's Conversations*, 192
 - Writing Assignment 4, Alternative A: The Voices of the Judge*, 194
 - Writing Assignment 4, Alternative B: The Lawyer's Conversations on Death*, 195
- C. Organizing Future Experience as a Lawmaker—How a Statute Works, 195
 1. The Statute as a Social Instrument: Establishing the Terms of Cooperation with Your Audience, 198
 - a. One Version of How the Statute Is Put to Work: Stating Issues and Defining Terms, 200
 - Tovey v. Geiser*, 202; *Young Women's Christian Home v. French*, 206
 - b. Three Problems on Defining Terms and Stating Issues, 210
 - Problem: *Stating the Issue*, 210; Problem: *Organ Transplant Statute*, 212; Problem: *Drafting an Abortion Statute*, 213
 - c. The Process of Cooperation Between Writer and Reader: The Statute as a Way of Giving Structure to Conversations, 215

2. A Case and Some Statutes on Wrongful Death, 218
 - Baker v. Bolton, 219; An Act for Compensating the Families of Persons Killed by Accidents (Lord Campbell's Act), 220; Georgia Code Annotated, 221; Illinois Annotated Statutes, 223
3. The Rhetoric of the Statute: How Is Such a Language to Be Controlled? 225
 - a. The Fiction of Relief: Damages and Other Remedies, 225
 - b. Fictions II: The Intellectual Structure of the Statute, 227
 - Writing Assignment 5: Drafting a Statute on Wrongful Death*, 240
 - Writing Assignment 5 (Alternative): Other Statutes*, 242

CHAPTER 3. HOW THE LAW TALKS ABOUT PEOPLE — “WHO IS THIS MAN?”

Introduction, 243

- A. Possibilities for the Definition and Expression of Character: The Law Among Others, 246
 1. Character and Caricature, 247
 - a. Being True and False to Life, 247
 - Douglas, A Plea for Better Manners, 248; Forster, Aspects of the Novel, 249; Macaulay, The History of England from the Accession of James II, 251; Macaulay, Notes on the Indian Penal Code, 253; Saki, The Talking-Out of Tarrington, 254; Saki, The Open Window, 256; Hilton, Lawyers at Play, 259; Miranda v. Arizona, 261; Dickens, Little Dorrit, 265; Dempsey, The Apple Falls Close to the Tree, 267; People v. Haney, 268; Hoffa v. United States, 272; Lamb, The Praise of Chimney-Sweepers, 274
 - b. The *Alcestis* of Euripides — A Play About Character and Caricature, 274
 - c. The Uses of Caricature, 278
 - Forster, Aspects of the Novel, 279; Chaucer, The Pardoner's Tale, 281; Theophrastus, The Characters, 284; Fiction and Reality in Talk About People: The Truth of Generalization, 286; Pope, Preface to The Iliad, 287; The Form of Solemnization of Matrimony, 288; I. and P. Opie, Children's Games in Streets and Playground, 288
 2. Other Possibilities for the Rendition of Character: Complications, Inconsistency, and Detail, 289
 - Troyat, Tolstoy, 291; Lawrence, Women in Love, 294; Shakespeare, Antony and Cleopatra, 298
 3. The Way Institutions Talk About People — A Fundamental Paradox for the Law, 299

4. Real Talk About Real People: Is There Someone Out There? 304
Proust, Remembrance of Things Past, 305; Clarendon, The History of the Rebellion and Civil Wars in England, 307; Adams, The Education of Henry Adams, 311
5. Defining Character in Your Own Life and Relationships, 313
Writing Assignment 6: Talking About Others, 315
Writing Assignment 6, Alternative A: A Letter of Recommendation, 315
Writing Assignment 6, Alternative B: Problems for a Prosecutor, 316
- B. Talking About People in a Language of Labels: The Insanity Defense, 317
 1. Proposals and Practices, 319
American Law Institute, Model Penal Code, 319; The Problem of Defining the Criteria of Irresponsibility, 320; Glueck, Law and Psychiatry, 324
 2. Talk About the Mind: The Fact of Difference, 328
Marais, The Soul of the White Ant, 329, 331; Marais, The Soul of the Ape, 332; Tinbergen, The Study of Instinct, 333; Ferrin v. People, 335; Dickinson, A Bird Came Down the Walk, 336
 3. Mental Illness: A Medical Problem for Medical Experts? 336
Washington v. United States, 337
 4. Using Labels by Following Purposes: The Living Language of the Criminal Law, 351
 - a. The Purposes of the Insanity Defense, 351
Mental Health Act, 352
 - b. The Relation Between Label and Purpose in the Criminal Law: Malice Aforethought, 354
People v. Conley, 354
Writing Assignment 7: The Insanity Defense, 360
Writing Assignment 7, Alternative A: Purposes of People and of the Law, 362
Writing Assignment 7, Alternative B: Drafting Instructions, 363
- C. Judgment Without Labels — The Sentencing Decision, 363
 1. What Do We Do with Our Freedom? — Existing Law and Practice, 365
Pennsylvania Statutes, 365; Commonwealth v. Ritter, 367; Glueck, The Sentencing Problem, 376; Talk About People in Terms of Groups, 386
 2. Expressing Judgments of Others: The Sentencing Problem as a Problem of Writing, 388
Bralove, Wall Street's Hippies, 390; Clarendon, The History of the Rebellion and Civil Wars in England, 394; Zeno, Life, 398;

- Jane Austen's *Pride and Prejudice*: Writing About Judgment, 401
Writing Assignment 8: Sentencing Judgments — Explanation and Directions, 407
 Questions: Cases on Sentencing, 410; United States v. Lewis, 411; R. v. Power, 412
Writing Assignment 8 (Alternative): The Judge Defines Himself, 413
- D. The Language of Institutional Disposition — Insanity, Sentencing, and Others, 413
 Gerard, Institutional Innovations in Juvenile Corrections, 414
Writing Assignment 9: Telling the Truth About an Institution, 423
Writing Assignment 9, Alternative A: Discovering the Truth About an Institution, 424
Writing Assignment 9, Alternative B: Right to Treatment, 425
 Parker, The Frying-Pan, 425
- E. How Should the Law Use the Language of Race? The Legal Use of Social Labels, 430
1. The Old Days: The Vicious Use of Racial Language, 432
 Louisiana Civil Code, 434; Laws of Mississippi, 437; Laws of Alabama, 439; Revised Code of North Carolina, 445; State v. Jones, 447; State v. Hoover, 448; State v. Mann, 451; Dave v. State, 455; Harper, Memoir on Slavery, 456; Hammond, Letters on Slavery, 458; Dew, On Slavery, 460; Lincoln, Address on Colonization to a Deputation of Colored Men, 462
 2. Amelioration and Abolition, 463
 Burke, Sketch of a Negro Code, 464; Illinois Revised Statutes, 471
Writing Assignment 10: The Abolition of Slavery, 474
 Yetman, Life Under the "Peculiar Institution," 474; Lincoln, Reply to a Committee from the Religious Denominations of Chicago . . . , 477; Lincoln, Preliminary Emancipation Proclamation, 478; Lincoln, Annual Message to Congress, 479; Lincoln, Letter to Gen. J. A. McClernand, 480; Lincoln, Proclamation of Amnesty and Reconstruction, 481; Fleming, Documentary History of Reconstruction, 482; Myrdal, An American Dilemma, 485
 3. These Days of Reform: The Benign Use of Racial Language, 488
 Questions: Racial Talk in Modern Law, 490; People ex rel. Altman v. Board of Education, 494
 4. What Is a Race? 496
 Hernandez v. Texas, 497; Stewart, Negro Dialect in the Teaching of Reading, 500
Writing Assignment 11: Using the Language of Race, 501
Writing Assignment 11, Alternative A: Race and the School System, 501

Writing Assignment 11, Alternative B: Race and the Law School, 502

Writing Assignment 11, Alternative C: Race in the Judicial Opinion, 503

CHAPTER 4. RULES AND RELATIONSHIPS

Introduction, 504

A. Using the Rule to Organize Social Experience, 506

1. Learning How to Behave: The Formation and Management of Social Expectations, by Rules and Otherwise, 506

Johnson, *Growing Up in the Black Belt*, 507; *The Rules of Amherst College*, 512; *Amherst College Bulletin*, 513; Perry, *Williamstown and Williams College*, 515; *Mayberry v. Pennsylvania*, 518; Homer, *Iliad*, 522; Arnold, *On the Discipline of Public Schools*, 525; Hughes, *Tom Brown's School Days*, 527; *Scott's Last Expedition*, 533

Writing Assignment 12: The Formation and Management of Social Expectations, 536

2. Vagueness, Specificity, and the Rule: The Implications of Form, 537

a. What Happens As a Rule Changes Form? 538

ABA *Canons of Professional Ethics* (1908), 538; *ABA Code of Professional Responsibility* (1970), 539

Writing Assignment 13: The Form of Ethical Rules, 542

b. The Constitutional Principle of Clarity — and the Practice, 543

Two Special Kinds of Legal Rules, 544

Writing Assignment 13, Alternative A: Reconciling Constitutional Principles and Practices, 545

c. Rules and Happiness: An Impossible Combination? 546

Ripley, *Letter to Emerson*, 546; *Constitution of Brook Farm*, 547; More, *Utopia*, 550; *Levitt and Sons, Homeowner's Guide*, 552; Shakespeare, *The Tempest*, 554; Neill, *Summerhill*, 555; Pfaff, *Reconciliation Agreement*, 558

Writing Assignment 13, Alternative B: Rules for Marriage, 565

d. What Are Rules Good For? 566

Writing Assignment 13, Alternative C: What Are Rules Good For? 566

B. Where Several Must Cooperate — The Art and Craft of Making Rules, 566

1. Setting the Terms of a Complex System: The Prison as Example, 567

Texas Dept. of Corrections, *Rules*, 567, 568; *Colorado State Peni-*

- tentiary, Rules, 571, 572; Wisconsin State Prison, Rules, 575; Wisconsin Correctional Inst., Responsible Living, 578
2. Drafting Institutional Rules, 579
 - a. Increasing Confidence: Having Rules Work Both Ways, 580
Illinois Unified Code of Corrections, 580
 - b. Are There Any Limits upon the Principle That Rules Should Work Both Ways? 583
Rule of St. Benedict, 584
 - c. Rules as a Way of Talking to People: Addressing One's Audience, 585
 - d. Particular Difficulties That Prison Rules Must Face, 586
 - e. What Remains to be Done After Your Rules Have Been Formulated — Controlling the Terms of Cooperation, 589
Writing Assignment 14: Drafting Prison Rules, 593
Writing Assignment 14, Alternative A: Rules for a College, 595
Writing Assignment 14, Alternative B: Labor Contract, 595
 3. How Should the Courts Speak to the Police? A Study in Institutional Relations, 595
 - a. Watts and Miranda: Finding Just the Right Way to Say "Involuntary," 596
Watts v. Indiana, 596; Miranda v. Arizona, 603; Questions: Attitudes Towards the Police, 605; Questions: Attitudes Towards the Suspect (I), 608; Attitudes Towards Confession, 608; Questions: Attitudes Towards the Suspect (II), 610; Questions: Attitudes Towards the Legislature — Choosing the Appropriate Form for a Rule, 611
Writing Assignment 15: Rules for the Police, 614
Writing Assignment 15, Alternative A: The Exclusionary Rule, 614
 - b. When and How Should a Court Enforce the Constitution by an Injunction Against the Police? 615
Wilson v. Webster, 615; Question: In What Circumstances Should a Court Issue an Injunction Against the Police? 616; Hernandez v. Noel, 617; Question: How Should an Injunction Be Framed? 617; Wheeler v. Goodman, 618; Houser v. Hill, 620
Writing Assignment 15, Alternative B: Enjoining the Police, 621

CHAPTER 5. JUDGMENT AND EXPLANATION: THE LEGAL MIND AT WORK

Introduction, 623

- A. The Place of the Rule in Legal Judgment, or: What Does the Good Judge Do with the Law — Cheat? 625

1. Rules and Justice: Plato's View, 625
 - Plato, *The Statesman*, 625; Plato, *Theaetetus*, 629; Plato, *The Republic*, 631
2. The Process of Judgment and the Rule, 642
 - Questions: Making and Expressing Judgments, 642; Burke, *Speech to the Electors of Bristol*, 645
 - a. Judgment and the Rule in the Law: The Nature of Equity, 646
 - Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 647; Maitland, *Equity*, 648; Maine, *Ancient Law*, 651
 - b. Judgment and the Rule: Outside the Law, 656
 - Fowler, *Dictionary of Modern English Usage*, 656; Post, *Etiquette*, 660; Johnson, *Preface to Shakespeare*, 664; Hooker, *Of the Laws of Ecclesiastical Polity*, 670
 - Writing Assignment 16: Excellence in Judgment and the Use of Rules*, 683
 - Writing Assignment 16, Alternative A: Are Rules Always Tentative?* 685
 - Writing Assignment 16, Alternative B: The Place of Rules*, 686
- B. Making a Language of Judicial Criticism: How Should We Talk About Legal Judgment? 686
 1. Talk About the Working Mind: Metaphors, Plain Speech, and the Language of Rationality, 688
 - a. Can You Find the Music in the Law? 688
 - b. A Famous Metaphor: Plato's Cave, 689
 - Plato, *The Republic*, 689
 - c. The Language of Rationality: The Mind as Machine? 694
 - Bentham, *The Principles of Morals and Legislation*, 695; Fuller, *The Forms and Limits of Adjudication*, 698; Commn. on the Third London Airport, Report, 700; Whorf, *The Relation of Habitual Thought and Behavior to Language*, 706
 - d. The Language of Judicial Rationality: Two Examples, 707
 - Freund, *Rationality in Judicial Decisions*, 707; Cardozo, *The Nature of the Judicial Process*, 711
 2. An Example for Analysis: *Griswold v. Connecticut*, 712
 - Griswold v. Connecticut*, 712; Problem: Choice of Form — Interest-Balancing Versus Rules of Law, 725
 3. Alexander Pope's *Essay on Criticism*: A Model for Judicial Criticism? 728
 - Writing Assignment 17: The Enterprise of Judicial Criticism*, 733
 - Writing Assignment 17, Alternative A: Excellence in the Judicial Opinion — Rationality and Beyond*, 734
 - Writing Assignment 17, Alternative B: What Do You Approve Of?* 734

Writing Assignment 17, Alternative C: Explaining a Decision,
735

United States v. White, 736

CHAPTER 6. THE IMAGINATION OF THE LAWYER

Introduction, 757

A. Is the Judge Really a Poet? 761

1. The Message and the Rule: What More Do We Find in the Poem and Opinion? 762

Boulton, *The Language of Politics in the Age of Wilkes and Burke*, 763

2. Reading the Poem: The Education of the Imagination? 766

Frost, *The Constant Symbol*, 766; Frost, *The Figure a Poem Makes*, 770; Frost, *Design*, 780; Frost, *Directive*, 780; Donne, *The Sun Rising*, 783; Marvell, *To His Coy Mistress*, 785; Herbert, *The Pulley*, 786; Browning, *Up at a Villa — Down in the City*, 787; Dickinson, *Our Little Kinsmen*, 790; Thomas, *Fern Hill*, 791; Wordsworth, *Upon Westminster Bridge*, 793; Keats, *To Autumn*, 793; Whitman, *Out of the Cradle Endlessly Rocking*, 795

3. More on the Judicial Opinion and the Poem, 800

Writing Assignment 18: The Judicial Opinion as a Constant Symbol, 804

Writing Assignment 18 (Alternative): What Beyond Paraphrase? 805

B. The Activity of Argument, 806

1. A Classical View of Rhetoric: Ethos, Pathos, and Logos, 810

Aristotle, *Rhetoric*, 810; Carlyle, *The French Revolution*, 815

2. What Is at Stake Here? Argument Over What a Case Involves, 822

Douglas, *Springfield Speech*, 823; Gregory, *Nigger: An Autobiography*, 843

3. The Mystery of Persuasion, 845

Shakespeare, *Macbeth*, 846

4. The Cost of Argument: The Mind of the Sophist, 850

Clarendon, *The Life of Clarendon*, 853

Writing Assignment 19: The Legal Argument, 856

Writing Assignment 19, Alternative A: The Quarrel and the Argument, 856

Writing Assignment 19, Alternative B: Argument as a Form That Destroys, 856

Writing Assignment 19, Alternative C: Making Up and Changing Your Mind, 857

Writing Assignment 19, Alternative D: The Art of Argument, 857

- C. The Narrative Imagination and the Claim of Meaning, 858
1. Telling a Story and Saying What It Means: Addressing an Incompatibility of Discourse, 861
 - a. Narrative and Analysis: The Differences Elaborated, 862
 - b. The Force of Narrative: A Pressure Towards the Inexpressible, 863
 - c. How the Story Begins: The Complicating Choices of Shape and Direction, 866
Dickens, *Little Dorrit*, 870
 - d. The Ending as Cliché: Controlling Narrative Conclusion, 872
 - e. The Force of Narrative: A Pressure Towards Falsehood? 875
Tolstoy, *War and Peace*, 875
 2. Reconciling the Demands of Imagination and Reality: The Historian as Model for the Lawyer? 878
Macaulay, *The History of England from the Accession of James II*, 879; Hume, *History of England*, 881; Macaulay, *The History of England from the Accession of James II*, 882; *The Nature of Historical Narrative*, 883
 3. The Creative (the Delusive?) Imagination, 889
Gibbon, *The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, 889; Burke, *Reflections on the Revolution in France*, 893; Marvell, *An Horatian Ode upon Cromwell's Return from Ireland*, 898; Jonson, *The Alchemist*, 902
 4. Placing the Private Self in a Narrative of the Public World: Clarendon's *History of the Rebellion*, 903
 - a. The Narrative, 905
 - b. Putting the Question: How to Live in Such a World? 919
Writing Assignment 20: Reconciling the Demands of Reality and Imagination, 925
Writing Assignment 20, Alternative A: Telling a Story and Saying What It Means, 925
Writing Assignment 20, Alternative B: Placing the Private Self in the Public World, 926
Writing Assignment 20, Alternative C: Rewriting an Old Assignment, 926
Writing Assignment 20, Alternative D: The Historian and the Lawyer, 926

CHAPTER 7. THE EDUCATION OF THE LAWYER

Introduction, 927

- A. Defining Our Subject Matter — What Is the Law and Where Can You Find It? 928
De Burgh v. De Burgh, 928

B. How Is the Law to be Learned? How Taught? 937

Abram, Educating the Lawyer as Policy-Maker, 938; Ascham, The Schoolmaster, 943

Writing Assignment 21: The Lawyer's Education, 947

APPENDIX: SUPPLEMENTARY WRITING ASSIGNMENTS

2-1: What Is a Good Conversation? 951

Oliver, The Endless Adventure, 953

2-2: Student-Talk and the Lawyer, 955

2-3: Metaphor and Cliché, 956

2-4: Translation, 957

2-5: Parody, 957

4: Giving Advice, 958

5-1: Making Directions Clear and Precise — More on the Statutory Rule, 959

5-2: A Judicial Opinion on a Statute, 960

7: Explaining Behavior, 961

17-1: The Mind of the Judge, 961

17-2: A Document That Teaches, 962

17-3: Drafting an Opinion in *Robinson v. California*, 962

Robinson v. California, 963

Major Writing Assignment, 967

Bibliographical Note, 968

Index, 971