CONTENTS

Preface, xix
Acknowledgments, xxi
Introduction to the Student, xxxi

CHAPTER 1. THE LAWYER AS WRITER

A. Learning the Language of the Law, 3
   Twain, Life on the Mississippi, 10; Dickens, American Notes, 13;
   Parkman, La Salle and the Discovery of the Great West, 15; Lévi-
   Strauss, Trois Tropiques, 17; Mailer, Of a Fire on the Moon, 19;
   Twain, Huckleberry Finn, 21; Labov, The Logic of Nonstandard
   English, 27
   Writing Assignment 1: A Variety of Languages, 34
   Writing Assignment 1, Alternative A: What Do Different
   Speakers Want to Know, 36
   Questions: Defining a Language System, 37; Questions: Drawing
   Inferences from Speech, 39; Harvard Law Review, With the Edi-
   tors, 41
   Writing Assignment 1, Alternative B: What Has It Meant for
   You to Learn the Legal Language System, 43
   Question: Who Will You Become? 47; James, The Art of Fiction,
   48

B. Success for the Lawyer and Writer: Establishing the Right Rela-
   tionship with His Language, 49
   1. Defining the Relationship Between Self and Language: Troilus
      and Cressida, 51
   2. Traditional Ways of Controlling a Language, 56
      a. Metaphor, 57
         Blake, The Sick Rose, 58; Conrad, The Mirror of the Sea, 60
      b. Irony, 64
         Thoreau, Walden, 65
      c. Ambiguity, 67
         Frost, The Road Not Taken, 69; Melville, Billy Budd, 70
CONTENTS

d. The Power of the Language Maker, 76
Writing Assignment 2: Controlling a Language System, 77
Writing Assignment 2 (Alternative): Good Writing, 78

CHAPTER 2. THE LIMITS AND RESOURCES OF
LEGAL LANGUAGE: AN INTRODUCTION TO
YOUR LITERARY CIRCUMSTANCES

Introduction, 81
A. Your Language in a Universe of Languages — A Comparative Anthology on Death, 83
   1. What the Law Leaves Out: The Law Among Other Possibilities for Expression, 84
      a. The Georgetown Hospital Case: A Paradigm of Legal Speech? 84
         Application of the President and Directors of Georgetown College, Inc., 84
      b. One Way the Lawyer Speaks About Death: The Will, 89
         Casner, Will of Richard Harry Black III, 89; Will of Edmund Burke, 94; Thomas, A Refusal to Mourn the Death, by Fire, of a Child in London, 97; Ransom, Janet Waking, 98; Dickinson, The Last Night That She Lived, 99
      c. Versions and Conversions of Experience: Imagining What the Law Would Do, 100
   d. A Primary Distinction in Talk About Death: Humanity and Inhumanity in Speech, 114
   e. Justifying a Language by Its Special Purposes, 126
   Royal Commn. on Capital Punishment, Report, 128; Colorado Revised Statutes, 130; Camus, Reflections on the Guillotine, 131; Furman v. Georgia, 137; Donnelly, Goldstein, and Schwartz, Criminal Law, 142; Dickens, A Tale of Two Cities, 149; Orwell, Shooting an Elephant, 151
CONTENTS

3. Complications: False Pretenses and Rhetorical Resources, 153
   Gibbon, The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire, 153; Hume, The Life of David Hume, Esq., 157; Smith, Letter to William Strahan, 160; Thucydides, History of the Peloponnesian War, 165; Froude, History of England from the Fall of Wolsey to the Death of Elizabeth, 166; Shakespeare, Romeo and Juliet, 166

4. Professional Attitudes: Uses and Effects of Professional Rhetoric, 167
   Joyce, A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man, 168; Proust, Remembrance of Things Past, 170; Norton, The Treatment of a Dying Patient, 174
   Writing Assignment 3: Defining by Comparison the Literature of the Law, 181
   Writing Assignment 3, Alternative A: The Law Controls the Speaker, 182
   Writing Assignment 3, Alternative B: Drafting a Complaint, 182
   Writing Assignment 3, Alternative C: A Judicial Opinion in the Georgetown Hospital Case, 186
   Writing Assignment 3, Alternative D: The Lawyer’s Conversations on Death, 186

   Problem: The Sabbatarian and the Military Law, 188; Selective Service Act of 1967, 189
   Writing Assignment 4: The Lawyer’s Conversations, 192
   Writing Assignment 4, Alternative A: The Voices of the Judge, 194
   Writing Assignment 4, Alternative B: The Lawyer’s Conversations on Death, 195

C. Organizing Future Experience as a Lawmaker—How a Statute Works, 195
   1. The Statute as a Social Instrument: Establishing the Terms of Cooperation with Your Audience, 198
         Tovey v. Geiser, 202; Young Women’s Christian Home v. French, 206
      b. Three Problems on Defining Terms and Stating Issues, 210
         Problem: Stating the Issue, 210; Problem: Organ Transplant Statute, 212; Problem: Drafting an Abortion Statute, 213
CONTENTS

2. A Case and Some Statutes on Wrongful Death, 218
   Baker v. Bolton, 219; An Act for Compensating the Families of
   Persons Killed by Accidents (Lord Campbell's Act), 220; Georgia
   Code Annotated, 221; Illinois Annotated Statutes, 223

3. The Rhetoric of the Statute: How Is Such a Language to Be Con-
   trolled? 225
   a. The Fiction of Relief: Damages and Other Remedies, 225
   b. Fictions II: The Intellectual Structure of the Statute, 227
      Writing Assignment 5: Drafting a Statute on Wrongful Death,
      240
      Writing Assignment 5 (Alternative): Other Statutes, 242

CHAPTER 3. HOW THE LAW TALKS ABOUT
PEOPLE — "WHO IS THIS MAN?"

Introduction, 243

A. Possibilities for the Definition and Expression of Character: The Law
Among Others, 246
   1. Character and Caricature, 247
      a. Being True and False to Life, 247
         Douglas, A Plea for Better Manners, 248; Forster, Aspects of the
         Novel, 249; Macaulay, The History of England from the Accession
         of James II, 251; Macaulay, Notes on the Indian Penal Code, 253;
         Saki, The Talking-Out of Tarrington, 254; Saki, The Open
         Window, 256; Hilton, Lawyers at Play, 259; Miranda v. Arizona,
         261; Dickens, Little Dorrit, 265; Dempsey, The Apple Falls Close
         to the Tree, 267; People v. Haney, 268; Hoffa v. United States,
         272; Lamb, The Praise of Chimney-Sweepers, 274
      b. The Acestis of Euripides — A Play About Character and Caricature,
         274
      c. The Uses of Caricature, 278
         Forster, Aspects of the Novel, 279; Chaucer, The Pardoner's Tale,
         281; Theophrastus, The Characters, 284; Fiction and Reality in
         Talk About People: The Truth of Generalization, 286; Pope,
         Preface to The Iliad, 287; The Form of Solemnization of Matrimo-
         nary, 288; I. and P. Opie, Children’s Games in Streets and Play-
         ground, 288

2. Other Possibilities for the Rendition of Character: Complica-
   tions, Inconsistency, and Detail, 289
   Troyat, Tolstoy, 291; Lawrence, Women in Love, 294; Shake-
   speare, Antony and Cleopatra, 298

3. The Way Institutions Talk About People — A Fundamental Para-
   dox for the Law, 299
CONTENTS

4. Real Talk About Real People: Is There Someone Out There? 304

5. Defining Character in Your Own Life and Relationships, 313
   Writing Assignment 6: Talking About Others, 315
   Writing Assignment 6, Alternative A: A Letter of Recommendation, 315
   Writing Assignment 6, Alternative B: Problems for a Prosecutor, 316

B. Talking About People in a Language of Labels: The Insanity Defense, 317
   1. Proposals and Practices, 319
      American Law Institute, Model Penal Code, 319; The Problem of Defining the Criteria of Irresponsibility, 320; Glueck, Law and Psychiatry, 324
   2. Talk About the Mind: The Fact of Difference, 328
      Marais, The Soul of the White Ant, 329, 331; Marais, The Soul of the Ape, 332; Tinbergen, The Study of Instinct, 333; Ferrin v. People, 335; Dickinson, A Bird Came Down the Walk, 336
      Washington v. United States, 337
   4. Using Labels by Following Purposes: The Living Language of the Criminal Law, 351
      a. The Purposes of the Insanity Defense, 351
         Mental Health Act, 352
      b. The Relation Between Label and Purpose in the Criminal Law: Malice Aforethought, 354
         People v. Conley, 354
         Writing Assignment 7: The Insanity Defense, 360
         Writing Assignment 7, Alternative A: Purposes of People and of the Law, 362
         Writing Assignment 7, Alternative B: Drafting Instructions, 363

C. Judgment Without Labels — The Sentencing Decision, 363
   1. What Do We Do with Our Freedom? — Existing Law and Practice, 365
      Pennsylvania Statutes, 365; Commonwealth v. Ritter, 367; Glueck, The Sentencing Problem, 376; Talk About People in Terms of Groups, 386
   2. Expressing Judgments of Others: The Sentencing Problem as a Problem of Writing, 388
CONTENTS

Jane Austen’s Pride and Prejudice: Writing About Judgment, 401
Writing Assignment 8: Sentencing Judgments — Explanation and Directions, 407
Questions: Cases on Sentencing, 410; United States v. Lewis, 411; R. v. Power, 412
Writing Assignment 8 (Alternative): The Judge Defines Himself, 413

D. The Language of Institutional Disposition — Insanity, Sentencing, and Others, 413
Gerard, Institutional Innovations in Juvenile Corrections, 414
Writing Assignment 9: Telling the Truth About an Institution, 423
Writing Assignment 9, Alternative A: Discovering the Truth About an Institution, 424
Writing Assignment 9, Alternative B: Right to Treatment, 425
Parker, The Frying-Pan, 425

E. How Should the Law Use the Language of Race? The Legal Use of Social Labels, 430
1. The Old Days: The Vicious Use of Racial Language, 432
Louisiana Civil Code, 434; Laws of Mississippi, 437; Laws of Alabama, 439; Revised Code of North Carolina, 445; State v. Jones, 447; State v. Hoover, 448; State v. Mann, 451; Dave v. State, 455; Harper, Memoir on Slavery, 456; Hammond, Letters on Slavery, 458; Dew, On Slavery, 460; Lincoln, Address on Colonization to a Deputation of Colored Men, 462

2. Amelioration and Abolition, 463
Burke, Sketch of a Negro Code, 464; Illinois Revised Statutes, 471
Writing Assignment 10: The Abolition of Slavery, 474
Yetman, Life Under the “Peculiar Institution,” 474; Lincoln, Reply to a Committee from the Religious Denominations of Chicago . . . , 477; Lincoln, Preliminary Emancipation Proclamation, 478; Lincoln, Annual Message to Congress, 479; Lincoln, Letter to Gen. J. A. McClemand, 480; Lincoln, Proclamation of Amnesty and Reconstruction, 481; Fleming, Documentary History of Reconstruction, 482; Myrdal, An American Dilemma, 485

3. These Days of Reform: The Benign Use of Racial Language, 488
Questions: Racial Talk in Modern Law, 490; People ex rel. Altman v. Board of Education, 494

4. What Is a Race? 496
Hernandez v. Texas, 497; Stewart, Negro Dialect in the Teaching of Reading, 500
Writing Assignment 11: Using the Language of Race, 501
Writing Assignment 11, Alternative A: Race and the School System, 501
CHAPTER 4. RULES AND RELATIONSHIPS

Introduction, 504
A. Using the Rule to Organize Social Experience, 506
   1. Learning How to Behave: The Formation and Management of Social Expectations, by Rules and Otherwise, 506
      Johnson, Growing Up in the Black Belt, 507; The Rules of Amherst College, 512; Amherst College Bulletin, 513; Perry, Williamstown and Williams College, 515; Mayberry v. Pennsylvania, 518; Homer, Iliad, 522; Arnold, On the Discipline of Public Schools, 525; Hughes, Tom Brown's School Days, 527; Scott's Last Expedition, 533
      Writing Assignment 12: The Formation and Management of Social Expectations, 536
   2. Vagueness, Specificity, and the Rule: The Implications of Form, 537
      a. What Happens As a Rule Changes Form? 538
         ABA Canons of Professional Ethics (1908), 538; ABA Code of Professional Responsibility (1970), 539
         Writing Assignment 13: The Form of Ethical Rules, 542
      b. The Constitutional Principle of Clarity — and the Practice, 543
         Two Special Kinds of Legal Rules, 544
         Writing Assignment 13, Alternative A: Reconciling Constitutional Principles and Practices, 545
      c. Rules and Happiness: An Impossible Combination? 546
         Ripley, Letter to Emerson, 546; Constitution of Brook Farm, 547; More, Utopia, 550; Levitt and Sons, Homeowner's Guide, 552; Shakespeare, The Tempest, 554; Neill, Summerhill, 555; Pfaff, Reconciliation Agreement, 558
         Writing Assignment 13, Alternative B: Rules for Marriage, 565
      d. What Are Rules Good For? 566
         Writing Assignment 13, Alternative C: What Are Rules Good For? 566
   B. Where Several Must Cooperate — The Art and Craft of Making Rules, 566
      1. Setting the Terms of a Complex System: The Prison as Example, 567
         Texas Dept. of Corrections, Rules, 567, 568; Colorado State Peni-
2. Drafting Institutional Rules, 579
   a. Increasing Confidence: Having Rules Work Both Ways, 580
      Illinois Unified Code of Corrections, 580
   b. Are There Any Limits upon the Principle That Rules Should
      Work Both Ways? 583
      Rule of St. Benedict, 584
   c. Rules as a Way of Talking to People: Addressing One’s Audience, 585
   d. Particular Difficulties That Prison Rules Must Face, 586
   e. What Remains to be Done After Your Rules Have Been
      Formulated — Controlling the Terms of Cooperation, 589
      Writing Assignment 14: Drafting Prison Rules, 593
      Writing Assignment 14, Alternative A: Rules for a College, 595
      Writing Assignment 14, Alternative B: Labor Contract, 595
3. How Should the Courts Speak to the Police? A Study in Institutional Relations, 595
      Watts v. Indiana, 596; Miranda v. Arizona, 603; Questions: Attitudes Towards the Police, 605; Questions: Attitudes Towards the Suspect (1), 608; Attitudes Towards Confession, 608; Questions: Attitudes Towards the Suspect (11), 610; Questions: Attitudes Towards the Legislature — Choosing the Appropriate Form for a Rule, 611
      Writing Assignment 15: Rules for the Police, 614
      Writing Assignment 15, Alternative A: The Exclusionary Rule, 614
   b. When and How Should a Court Enforce the Constitution by
      an Injunction Against the Police? 615
      Wilson v. Webster, 615; Question: In What Circumstances
      Should a Court Issue an Injunction Against the Police? 616;
      Hernandez v. Noel, 617; Question: How Should an Injunction Be
      Framed? 617; Wheeler v. Goodman, 618; Houser v. Hill, 620
      Writing Assignment 15, Alternative B: Enjoining the Police, 621

CHAPTER 5. JUDGMENT AND EXPLANATION:
THE LEGAL MIND AT WORK

Introduction, 623
A. The Place of the Rule in Legal Judgment, or: What Does the Good Judge Do with the Law — Cheat? 625
1. Rules and Justice: Plato’s View, 625
   Plato, The Statesman, 625; Plato, Theaetetus, 629; Plato, The Republic, 631
2. The Process of Judgment and the Rule, 642
   Questions: Making and Expressing Judgments, 642; Burke, Speech to the Electors of Bristol, 645
      Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics, 647; Maitland, Equity, 648; Maine, Ancient Law, 651
   b. Judgment and the Rule: Outside the Law, 656
      Fowler, Dictionary of Modern English Usage, 656; Post, Etiquette, 660; Johnson, Preface to Shakespeare, 664; Hooker, Of the Laws of Ecclesiastical Polity, 670
   Writing Assignment 16: Excellence in Judgment and the Use of Rules, 683
   Writing Assignment 16, Alternative A: Are Rules Always Tentative? 685
   Writing Assignment 16, Alternative B: The Place of Rules, 686
   1. Talk About the Working Mind: Metaphors, Plain Speech, and the Language of Rationality, 688
      a. Can You Find the Music in the Law? 688
      b. A Famous Metaphor: Plato’s Cave, 689
         Plato, The Republic, 689
      c. The Language of Rationality: The Mind as Machine? 694
         Bentham, The Principles of Morals and Legislation, 695; Fuller, The Forms and Limits of Adjudication, 698; Commn. on the Third London Airport, Report, 700; Whorf, The Relation of Habitual Thought and Behavior to Language, 706
      d. The Language of Judicial Rationality: Two Examples, 707
         Freund, Rationality in Judicial Decisions, 707; Cardozo, The Nature of the Judicial Process, 711
      Griswold v. Connecticut, 712; Problem: Choice of Form — Interest-Balancing Versus Rules of Law, 725
      Writing Assignment 17: The Enterprise of Judicial Criticism, 733
      Writing Assignment 17, Alternative A: Excellence in the Judicial Opinion — Rationality and Beyond, 734
      Writing Assignment 17, Alternative B: What Do You Approve Of? 734
CHAPTER 6: THE IMAGINATION OF THE LAWYER

Introduction, 757
A. Is the Judge Really a Poet? 761
   1. The Message and the Rule: What More Do We Find in the
      Poem and Opinion? 762
         Boulton, The Language of Politics in the Age of Wilkes and
         Burke, 763
   2. Reading the Poem: The Education of the Imagination? 766
      Frost, The Constant Symbol, 766; Frost, The Figure a Poem
      Makes, 770; Frost, Design, 780; Frost, Directive, 780; Donne, The
      Sun Rising, 783; Marvell, To His Coy Mistress, 785; Herbert, The
      Pulley, 786; Browning, Up at a Villa—Down in the City, 787;
      Dickinson, Our Little Kinsmen, 790; Thomas, Fern Hill, 791;
      Wordsworth, Upon Westminster Bridge, 793; Keats, To Autumn,
      793; Whitman, Out of the Cradle Endlessly Rocking, 795
   3. More on the Judicial Opinion and the Poem, 800
      Writing Assignment 18: The Judicial Opinion as a Constant
      Symbol, 804
      Writing Assignment 18 (Alternative): What Beyond Paraphrase? 805
B. The Activity of Argument, 806
   1. A Classical View of Rhetoric: Ethos, Pathos, and Logos, 810
      Aristotle, Rhetoric, 810; Carlyle, The French Revolution, 815
   2. What Is at Stake Here? Argument Over What a Case Involves, 822
      Douglas, Springfield Speech, 823; Gregory, Nigger: An Autobiography, 843
   3. The Mystery of Persuasion, 845
      Shakespeare, Macbeth, 846
   4. The Cost of Argument: The Mind of the Sophist, 850
      Clarendon, The Life of Clarendon, 853
      Writing Assignment 19: The Legal Argument, 856
      Writing Assignment 19, Alternative A: The Quarrel and the
      Argument, 856
      Writing Assignment 19, Alternative B: Argument as a Form
      That Destroys, 856
      Writing Assignment 19, Alternative C: Making Up and Changing
      Your Mind, 857
      Writing Assignment 19, Alternative D: The Art of Argument, 857
C. The Narrative Imagination and the Claim of Meaning, 858
   1. Telling a Story and Saying What It Means: Addressing an Incompatibility of Discourse, 861
      a. Narrative and Analysis: The Differences Elaborated, 862
      b. The Force of Narrative: A Pressure Towards the Inexpressible, 863
      c. How the Story Begins: The Complicating Choices of Shape and Direction, 866
         Dickens, Little Dorrit, 870
      d. The Ending as Cliché: Controlling Narrative Conclusion, 872
      e. The Force of Narrative: A Pressure Towards Falseness? 875
         Tolstoy, War and Peace, 875
   2. Reconciling the Demands of Imagination and Reality: The Historian as Model for the Lawyer? 878
   3. The Creative (the Delusive?) Imagination, 889
      Gibbon, The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire, 889; Burke, Reflections on the Revolution in France, 893; Marvell, An Horatian Ode upon Cromwell's Return from Ireland, 898; Jonson, The Alchemist, 902
   4. Placing the Private Self in a Narrative of the Public World: Clarendon's History of the Rebellion, 903
      a. The Narrative, 905
      b. Putting the Question: How to Live in Such a World? 919
      Writing Assignment 20: Reconciling the Demands of Reality and Imagination, 925
      Writing Assignment 20, Alternative A: Telling a Story and Saying What It Means, 925
      Writing Assignment 20, Alternative B: Placing the Private Self in the Public World, 926
      Writing Assignment 20, Alternative C: Rewriting an Old Assignment, 926
      Writing Assignment 20, Alternative D: The Historian and the Lawyer, 926

CHAPTER 7. THE EDUCATION OF THE LAWYER

Introduction, 927
A. Defining Our Subject Matter — What Is the Law and Where Can You Find It? 928
   De Burgh v. De Burgh, 928
B. How Is the Law to be Learned? How Taught? 937
   Abram, Educating the Lawyer as Policy-Maker, 938; Ascham, The
   Schoolmaster, 943
   Writing Assignment 21: The Lawyer’s Education, 947

APPENDIX: SUPPLEMENTARY WRITING ASSIGNMENTS

2–1: What Is a Good Conversation? 951
   Oliver, The Endless Adventure, 953
2–2: Student Talk and the Lawyer, 955
2–3: Metaphor and Cliché, 956
2–4: Translation, 957
2–5: Parody, 957
4: Giving Advice, 958
5–1: Making Directions Clear and Precise — More on the Statutory
   Rule, 959
5–2: A Judicial Opinion on a Statute, 960
7: Explaining Behavior, 961
17–1: The Mind of the Judge, 961
17–2: A Document That Teaches, 962
17–3: Drafting an Opinion in Robinson v. California, 962
   Robinson v. California, 963
   Major Writing Assignment, 967

Bibliographical Note, 968

Index, 971