# PubPol/Econ 541

Classes 3, 4 Tariffs and Quotas

> by Alan V. Deardorff University of Michigan 2023



#### Announcements

- New optional reading for last week
  - Article by Indira Rajaraman, grad-school classmate of mine, now in India, on India's new laptop policy.
    - She says "I think it is important for students in the West to know that good stuff is available in non-Western sources, written in English they can understand, just to alert them to the advantages of not confining themselves to sources like the WSJ which has a few correspondents piping in news about the rest of the world."



# **Pause for News**

Class 0: Introduction & Overview

#### Announcements

- I will stay only very briefly in my office hour this morning, as I have a meeting to attend. If you want to see me, either stay after class or come right at 10:00.
- Quizzes in general
  - Clarify my expectations:
    - Feel free to look up anything you like from course or other sources.
    - But write your answers yourself and do not work with other students.
    - In "short answer" questions, no need to write paragraphs or even sentences if you can convey what I ask for.

#### Announcements

• Quiz 1 Scores

	Q1
Mean	7.80
Median	8
Max	10
Min	1
S.D.	2.19

# **Pause for Discussion**

#### Questions from KOM

- How do "specific" and "ad valorem" tariffs differ?
- An import demand curve is sometimes called a "derived demand curve." Why?
- What is an "effective rate of protection"?

# Outline for Today and Wednesday

- Tariff by Small country
- Tariff by large country
- Quotas

# Small country

- Assumptions throughout
  - Markets perfectly competitive (many small buyers and sellers)
  - Product homogeneous (all units from all suppliers the same)
  - Markets in equilibrium (quantities supplied and demanded equal)
  - There are no "distortions" (externalities, etc.)
    - This includes no taxes other than tariffs
  - Supply and demand curves are straight lines
    - Just for simplicity
  - Model is partial equilibrium (takes all other prices as given)
  - Model is static (time does not play any role)
  - Trade is free and frictionless
    - No tariffs or quotas other than those we introduce
    - No transport costs (for simplicity)

## Small country

- Special assumption for small country case
  - World price is given (country too small to influence it)
  - More correctly: country's supply and demand in that industry too small to influence the world price

# Small country, Import Industry



Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

#### Welfare Effects

- Why *a* and (*a*+*b*)?
- Area a
  - Loss of "producer surplus"
  - -Zero to S<sub>0</sub>
    - Lost revenue
  - $-S_0$  to  $S_{aut}$ 
    - Lost profit from P<sub>aut</sub> above MC





#### Welfare Effects



## Welfare Effects

- Note that these welfare effects are
  - Measured in currency, price times quantity
  - Loss of producer surplus is what suppliers would be "willing to pay" to avoid the loss
  - Gain in consumer surplus is what buyers would be "willing to pay" to get this benefit
- This does <u>not</u> tell us about individual buyers and sellers, only them as a group

# Small country tariff

- Tariff makes importing buyers pay more than the foreign exporters receive
  - By size of tariff, % or \$
  - Difference goes to importing government
- Small country means that world price does not change
- So domestic price rises above world price by amount of the tariff

## Small country tariff



- Effects of a tariff, starting from free trade
  - Price rises for both the
    - Imported good
    - Domestically produced good
  - Quantity supplied rises
  - Quantity demanded falls
  - Quantity of imports falls
  - Tariff revenue rises from zero

#### Specific Tariff t



Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

#### Small country tariff



Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

# **Pause for Discussion**

#### Questions on Graph

- If a price falls, why does the gain to demanders not equal the fall in what they pay? Is it larger than this or smaller?
- If a price rises, why is the gain to suppliers not their rise in revenue? Is it larger or smaller?
- In what sense does a small country gain by eliminating a tariff? Does anybody in the country lose?

# Small country, larger tariff



- Effects of doubling the tariff
  - Price rises by twice as much
  - Imports fall by twice as much
  - Deadweight loss is 4-times as large!
    - (Efficiency loss rises with the square of the tariff)

(These are exact only if S and D are straight lines. Approximate otherwise.)

#### Specific Tariffs, t, then 2t

### Small country, prohibitive tariff



## Comparative Statics with Tariff Fall in World Price



Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

# Comparative Statics with Tariff Fall in World Price



- Welfare effects of a fall in world price in presence of specific tariff
  - Suppliers lose –a
  - Demanders gain +(a+b+c+d)
  - Government gains +(e+f)
  - Country gains +(b+c+d+e+f)

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

# Pause for Your Questions

# **Pause for Discussion**

# Questions on Lahart, "The Imperfect Science ..."

- Why does Lahart say the measurement of harm from tariffs is an "imperfect science"?
- Lahart cited an estimate of loss from Trump's tariffs and retaliation of 1.3% of GDP. Is this big?
- What effects of tariffs are missing from the welfare effects of tariffs?

 Let p<sup>w</sup> be world price and p<sup>h</sup> be price in home market. With ad valorem tariff, t, <u>assumed</u> not large enough to stop trade:

 $p^h = (1+t)p^w$ 

• Demand:

• Supply:

• Imports:

 $Q^{d} = D(p^{h})$  $Q^{s} = S(p^{h})$  $Q^{m} = Q^{d} - Q^{s}$ 

NOTE: Used specific tariff in graphs, ad valorem in eqns. Both are for simplicity.

- Without tariff (free trade; t = 0):  $p^{h0} = p^w$  $Q^{m0} = D(p^w) - S(p^w)$
- With tariff, t > 0:  $p^{h1} = (1+t)p^{w}$  $Q^{m1} = D((1+t)p^{w}) - S((1+t)p^{w})$

• Notation: Let

$$\Delta x = x^1 - x^0$$

for x = p, Q, etc. Then  $\Delta p^h = p^{h1} - p^{h0} = (1+t)p^w - p^w = tp^w$ and

$$t = \frac{\Delta p^h}{p^w} = \frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}}$$

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

- It is most convenient to work with percentage changes and elasticities:
- Percentage change in any variable, *x*, is Percent change in  $x = \frac{\Delta x}{x}$
- Elasticity of x with respect to y is



Elasticity of (home) demand (η):

$$\eta = \frac{\Delta Q^{d}}{Q^{d0}} / \frac{\Delta p^{h}}{p^{h0}} \quad \text{or} \quad \frac{\Delta Q^{d}}{Q^{d0}} = \eta \, \frac{\Delta p^{h}}{p^{h0}}$$

- Note that  $\eta < 0$  (downward sloping)
- Elasticity of (home) supply (ε):

$$\varepsilon = \frac{\Delta Q^s}{Q^{s0}} / \frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}} \text{ or } \frac{\Delta Q^s}{Q^{s0}} = \varepsilon \frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}}$$

When you know the price change, ci use these to find the quantity change

- Notes regarding elasticities:
  - They'll be defined here as changes relative to the free-trade quantities and prices.
  - Different, but just as valid, would be changes relative to quantities and prices in the presence of the tariff.
  - Answers will differ, but by much less than our uncertainty about the values of elasticities.
  - In your calculations, use whichever is most convenient, but be consistent.

- Data are usually values, not quantities.
- Values of initial quantities:
- Demand:  $V^{d0} = p^{h0}Q^{d0} = p^w Q^{d0}$
- Supply:
- Imports:

$$V^{s0} = p^{h0}Q^{s0} = p^{w}Q^{s0}$$

$$V^{m0} = p^{w0} \left( Q^{d0} - Q^{s0} \right)$$

• Effects of tariff on quantities:

Demand:  $\Delta Q^d = \eta t Q^{d0}$ Supply:  $\Delta Q^s = \varepsilon t Q^{s0}$ 



I'll use  $\langle a \rangle$ ,  $\langle abcd \rangle$ , *etc*. to represent these areas.

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas


• Welfare gain of suppliers (producers & upstream):



Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

• Welfare gain of suppliers (producers & upstream):



Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

Welfare loss of demanders (consumers and downstream):  $WLD = \langle abcd \rangle = \langle abcde \rangle - \langle e \rangle$  $= (Q^{d0})(\Delta p^{h}) - \frac{1}{2}(|\Delta Q^{d}|)(\Delta p^{h})$  $= \left(1 - \frac{1}{2} \frac{|\Delta Q^d|}{Q^{d_0}}\right) Q^{d_0} \Delta p^h$  $S(p^h)$  $= \left(1 + \frac{1}{2} \frac{\Delta Q^d}{O^{d0}}\right) p^{h0} Q^{d0} \frac{\Delta p^h}{n^{h0}}$  $(1+t)p^w$  $= \left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\eta \frac{\Delta p^{h}}{p^{h0}}\right) V^{d0} \frac{\Delta p^{h}}{p^{h0}}$ e  $\Delta p^h = t p^w$  $D(p^h)$  $=\left(1+\frac{1}{2}\eta t\right)tV^{d0}$ 0<sup>s0</sup> 0<sup>s1</sup>  $O^{d1} O^{d0}$ 0

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

- Revenue gain of (home) government:
  - $R = \langle c \rangle$  $(1+t)p^{w}$ el  $\Delta p^h = t p^w \cdot p^w \cdot$  $= (Q^{d1} - Q^{s1})\Delta p^h$ а  $= (Q^{d0} + \Delta Q^d - Q^{s0} - \Delta Q^s)tp^w$  $O^{s0}$  $O^{S1}$  $O^{d0}$  $= \left( Q^{d0} \left( 1 + \frac{\Delta Q^d}{Q^{d0}} \right) - Q^{s0} \left( 1 + \frac{\Delta Q^s}{Q^{s0}} \right) \right) t p^w$  $= \left( Q^{d0} \left( 1 + \eta \frac{\Delta p^{h}}{p^{h0}} \right) - Q^{s0} \left( 1 + \varepsilon \frac{\Delta p^{h}}{p^{h0}} \right) \right) t p^{w}$  $= \left| \left( V^{d0} (1 + \eta t) - V^{s0} (1 + \varepsilon t) \right) t \right|$

 $S(p^h)$ 

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas



• Summary:

• WGS = 
$$\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon t\right)tV^{s0}$$

• WLD = 
$$\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\eta t\right)tV^{d0}$$

•  $\mathsf{R} = \left( V^{d0}(1+\eta t) - V^{s0}(1+\varepsilon t) \right) t$ 

• WCC = 
$$-\left[\frac{1}{2}\varepsilon t^2 V^{s0} - \frac{1}{2}\eta t^2 V^{d0}\right]$$

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

WGS = Welfare Gain of Suppliers WLD = Welfare Loss of Demanders R = Government Revenue WCC = Welfare Change of Country

# **Pause for Discussion**

### Questions on Equations

- What information do you need to calculate these welfare effects?
- How do the equations change with larger tariffs?
- Explain the sources of the "production distortion loss" and the "consumption distortion loss."
  - Why does each occur, and who is it that loses in each case?
  - Where do these appear in the equations?

### Outline

- Tariff by Small country
- Tariff by large country
- Quotas



#### Autarky

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas



#### Free trade



#### Free trade



#### Specific Tariff, *t*, by Home Requires: P=P\*+*t*, MD=XS\*



#### Large country, World Market



#### Large country, World Market



Thus large country will gain from tariff if *c>b* 

• What is area c?

- The portion of the tariff paid by foreign exporters, who get a lower price
- A transfer from foreign producers to the home government
- The result of improving the home country's "terms of trade"

"Terms of Trade"  $\equiv$  Relative price of exports  $= P^{X}/P^{M}$ 

# **Pause for Discussion**

### **Questions on Large Country**

- The figure for the world market shows the tariff causing the world price to fall. What in the figure tells you that the Home country is large?
- In what sense might a large country gain by using a tariff? Who in the country benefits from that gain?
- What reasons are there, if any, for a large country <u>not</u> to levy a tariff?

#### Large country, "Optimal" tariff Watch as *t* rises



Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

#### Large country, "Optimal" tariff Watch as *t* rises

![](_page_55_Figure_1.jpeg)

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

![](_page_56_Figure_0.jpeg)

#### How Sizes and Slopes Matter

![](_page_57_Figure_1.jpeg)

Free trade

Tariff

#### How Slopes (Elasticities) Matter

![](_page_58_Figure_1.jpeg)

Free trade

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

#### **How Sizes Matter**

![](_page_59_Figure_1.jpeg)

Free trade

Tariff

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

# Pause for Your Questions

- Countries i = h, f = home, foreign
- Prices  $p^i$ , i = h, f
  - With free trade, equilibrium #0:

$$p^{h0} = p^{f0} (= p^{w0})$$

 With specific tariff, t, levied by country h on export of f, equilibrium #1:

$$p^{h1} = p^{f1} + t$$

Ad valorem equivalent of the specific tariff at the initial price:

Go to Solution

Skipping slides 63-74

$$\tau = \frac{\tau}{p^{h0}}$$

Domestic supply and demand in each country,
 i = h, f, are represented by their elasticities:

$$\varepsilon^{i} = \frac{\Delta Q^{is}}{Q^{is0}} / \frac{\Delta p^{i}}{p^{i0}} > 0 \quad \text{or } \Delta Q^{is} = \varepsilon^{i} \frac{\Delta p^{i}}{p^{i0}} Q^{is0}$$

$$\eta^{i} = \frac{\Delta Q^{id}}{Q^{id0}} \Big/ \frac{\Delta p^{i}}{p^{i0}} < 0 \quad \text{or } \Delta Q^{id} = \eta^{i} \frac{\Delta p^{i}}{p^{i0}} Q^{id0}$$

- Notation
  - Values of initial supply and demand, i = h, f:  $V^{is0} = p^{i0}Q^{is0}$  $V^{id0} = p^{i0}Q^{id0}$
  - Value of initial (home-country) imports:  $M^{0} = (V^{hd0} - V^{hs0})$
  - Convenient values, capturing both size and price responsiveness, i = h, f:  $A^i \equiv \varepsilon^i V^{is0} - \eta^i V^{id0} > 0$  $\overline{A} = A^h + A^f > 0$

• Price changes must add up to tariff:

$$\Delta p^h - \Delta p^f = t$$

• Divide by 
$$p^{h0} = p^{f0}$$
:  

$$\frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}} - \frac{\Delta p^f}{p^{f0}} = \frac{t}{p^{h0}} = \tau$$

or:

$$\frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}} = \frac{\Delta p^f}{p^{f0}} + \tau$$

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

• Equilibrium quantities:

$$\Delta Q^{hd} - \Delta Q^{hs} = \Delta Q^{fs} - \Delta Q^{fd}$$

• Use elasticities:

$$\eta^h \frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}} Q^{hd0} - \varepsilon^h \frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}} Q^{hs0} = \varepsilon^f \frac{\Delta p^f}{p^{f0}} Q^{fs0} - \eta^f \frac{\Delta p^f}{p^{f0}} Q^{fd0}$$

• Multiply through by  $p^{h0} = p^{f0}$  to get values:

$$A^{h}\left(\eta^{h}V^{hd0} - \varepsilon^{h}V^{hs0}\right)\frac{\Delta p^{h}}{p^{h0}} = \left(\varepsilon^{h}fV^{fs0} - \eta^{f}V^{fd0}\right)\frac{\Delta p^{f}}{p^{f0}}$$

• or:

![](_page_65_Figure_8.jpeg)

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

• This gives us two equations in two unknowns,  $\frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}} \& \frac{\Delta p^f}{p^{f0}}$ :

$$\frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}} = \frac{\Delta p^f}{p^{f0}} + \tau$$

$$A^h \frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}} = -A^f \frac{\Delta p^f}{p^{f0}}$$

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

• Solution:

$$A^{h} \frac{\Delta p^{h}}{p^{h0}} = A^{h} \left( \frac{\Delta p^{f}}{p^{f0}} + \tau \right) = -A^{f} \frac{\Delta p^{f}}{p^{f0}}$$

$$= \left( A^{h} + A^{f} \right) \frac{\Delta p^{f}}{p^{f0}} = -A^{h} \qquad \text{Where} \\ A^{h} \approx \text{Home size} \\ A^{f} \approx \text{Foreign size} \\ \overline{A}^{f} \approx \text{Foreign size} \\ \overline{A} = A^{h} + A^{f}$$

$$\frac{\Delta p^{h}}{p^{h0}} = -\frac{A^{h}}{\overline{A}} \tau + \frac{A^{h} + A^{f}}{\overline{A}} \tau = \frac{A^{f}}{\overline{A}} \tau$$

$$\frac{\Delta p^{h}}{p^{h0}} = \frac{A^{f}}{\overline{A}} \tau$$

$$Classes 3, 4: \text{ Tariffs and Quotas}$$

- Interpretation:
  - Ratio of two price changes:

$$R \equiv \frac{\Delta p^{h}}{-\Delta p^{f}} = \frac{\Delta p^{h}/p^{h0}}{-\Delta p^{f}/p^{f0}} = \frac{A^{f}}{A^{h}}$$

- Home country share of tariff incidence:

$$S \equiv \frac{\Delta p^h}{\Delta p^h - \Delta p^f} = \frac{A^f}{A^h + A^f}$$

- Recall that  $A^i = \varepsilon^i V^{is0} \eta^i V^{id0}$  measures country <u>size</u> in this industry:
  - Small home country: if  $A^h \to 0$ ;  $R \to \infty$ ;  $S \to 1$
  - Large home country: if  $A^h \approx A^f$ ;  $R \approx 1$ ;  $S \approx 1/2$

• Welfare of home country:

 $WHC = \langle e \rangle - \langle b \rangle - \langle d \rangle$ 

![](_page_69_Figure_3.jpeg)

![](_page_69_Figure_4.jpeg)

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

• Welfare of home country:

 $WHC = \langle e \rangle - \langle b \rangle - \langle d \rangle$ 

![](_page_70_Figure_3.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Figure_4.jpeg)

#### Welfare of Home Country

$$WHC = \langle e \rangle - (\langle b \rangle + \langle d \rangle) = \left[ \frac{A^h}{\bar{A}} M^0 \tau - \frac{A^{h^2} A^f}{\bar{A}^2} \tau^2 \right] - \frac{A^h A^{f^2}}{2\bar{A}^2} \tau^2$$

![](_page_71_Figure_2.jpeg)

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas
## **Two-Country in Equations**

• Other effects can be calculated similarly from the areas in the figure:



Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

## **Two-Country in Equations**



Note that as  $A^h$  goes to zero, so does  $\frac{A^h}{\overline{A}}$  and WFC.

However, area  $\langle h \rangle$  may not, so the welfare effects on foreign demanders and suppliers separately are not negligible.

## **Two-Country in Equations**

• Solution:

$$\frac{\Delta p^f}{p^{f0}} = -\frac{A^h}{\bar{A}}\tau$$

$$\frac{\Delta p^h}{p^{h0}} = \frac{A^f}{\bar{A}}\tau$$

Where  $A^h \approx$  Home size  $A^f \approx$  Foreign size  $\overline{A} = A^h + A^f$ 

## Is the US a Large Country?

Consider Trump's 25% tariff on steel

$$\frac{\Delta p^{f}}{p^{f0}} = -\frac{A^{US}}{\bar{A}} 25\%$$
$$A^{US} \equiv \varepsilon^{US} V^{USs0} - \eta^{US} V^{USd0}$$
$$\bar{A} = A^{US} + A^{f}$$

- So
  - Foreign price of steel should fall by 25% times the US share of the world market
  - US price of steel should rise by 25% of the foreign share of the world market

## Is the US a Large Country?

- What matters is, approximately, the US share of the world market for steel.
- In 2018 (from Wikipedia)
  - US/World production  $\approx 5\%$
  - US/World demand  $\approx 7\%$
- So US share was, at most, 7%
  - World price change 7% of 25%: negative < 2%</p>
  - US price change 93% of 25%: positive > 23%
- Several studies of the 2018 tariffs showed
  - No perceptible fall in world prices
  - US prices rose by amount of tariffs

## **Pause for Discussion**

## Questions Martin, "US Importers Bore Cost..."

- By how much did prices of items subject to tariffs rise?
- How much did this mean for individual items?
- How much did imports decline from China?
- Has USTR under Biden responded?

## Pause for Your Questions

## Outline

- Tariff by Small country
- Tariff by large country
- Quotas

## Quotas

- Quota puts upper limit on <u>quantity</u> of imports
- Analysis is exactly the same as a tariff, except
  - Policy sets quantity of imports
  - Price difference is determined by the market (supply & demand)
  - Price difference is called "tariff equivalent" of the quota
- Welfare analysis of quota is the same as tariff, except
  - "Quota rent" instead of tariff revenue
- Who gets the quota rent?
  - Depends on how quota is administered
  - Most commonly, goes to foreigners

# Small country quota (with rents to foreigners)



Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

## Large country quota (with rents to foreigners)



Welfare effects of a largecountry quota, starting from free trade

• Home:

Private sector (S&D) loses-(a+b)Government gains0Country must lose:-(a+b)

Foreign:

Private sector (S&D) loses-(c+d)Foreigners gain rents+(a+c)

+a-d

Country may gain or lose

World loses
"Dead weight Loss" (-(b+d))

Classes 3, 4: Tariffs and Quotas

## **Pause for Discussion**

## Questions on Quotas from Deardorff "Nontariff ..."

- How might quotas be administered; what happens to the quota rents in each case?
- How is an import quota equivalent to a tariff? How is it not?
- With a fixed and binding import quota, how will the domestic price and the tariffequivalent of the quota change if curves shift?